
May 11, 2023
Agenda

• **Racial Equity Context: Departmental, City-Wide & National Initiative**
• **Office of Racial Equity Reporting Milestones**
• **SFHSS Data-Driven Approach**
• **Equity Practice Implementation**
• **Equity Practice Learnings**

Presentation Aim

• Provide overview of racial equity work and seek ongoing collaborative input
City-wide Racial Equity Mandate

The Office of Racial Equity (ORE) was formally created by legislative ordinance No 188-19. ORE serves as a new division of the Human Rights Commission with authority to create a citywide Racial Equity Framework and mandate the completion of departmental Racial Equity Action Plans (REAP).

www.racialequitysf.org

Government Alliance for Race & Equity

The City and County of San Francisco is a part of GARE’s national network of municipal, regional and state governments (100 cities and 30 states) working to achieve racial equity and advance opportunities for all.

www.racialequityalliance.org
Phase I: Organizational Transformation

Focuses on internal staff programs and policies. Phase 1 uses the Racial Equity Survey for departments to inform their plan and center on building empowering workplace environments.

Target Population: 50+ SFHSS Staff

Framework Delivered to All CCSF Departments Core Focus Areas, Templated Initiatives

Phase II: Service Delivery

Focuses on the delivery of external services and programs. Phase 2 will center on community engagement and external equity indicators to support vulnerable populations.

Target Population: 120K+ Covered Lives

Framework Currently Under Development To be developed by ORE 2023
SFHSS Racial Equity Experience

- **Winter ’18**: Employee Engagement Survey, Racial Equity Foundations Leadership Training, Office of Racial Equity Formed
- **Summer ’19**: Government Alliance for Race and Equity Learning Cohort, Citywide Racial Equity Working Group
- **Fall ’19**: Engagement Activity: Equation for Trust
- **Spring ’20**: Internal Racial Equity Advisory Formed
- **Summer ’20**: REAP Phase I Framework Released, All-Staff Racial Equity Climate Survey & Foundations Training Engagement Activity: Early Experiences with Race
- **Fall ’20**: Quantitative & Qualitative Data Analysis, Engagement Activity: Racial Equity Visioning
- **Winter ’20**: REAP Phase I presented to Health Service Board and submitted to Office of Racial Equity
ORE Reporting Milestones (Completed)

May 2021

Visit the Health Service Board calendar for Presentation Archives:
SFHSS Racial Equity Action Plan approval from Health Service Board (Dec 2020)
REAP Business Initiative Report provided to Health Service Board (Dec 2021)
REAP Annual Update presentation provided to Health Service Board (Dec 2021)
Departmental Racial Equity Progress Report Annual Report for 2021 (May 2022)
Tracking Membership to Improve Racial Equity

Race/ethnicity data for our membership has greatly improved in 2023 by 5,301 employees.

In 2023, the number of employees who did not enter race data was reduced to 1,849 employees.
Tracking Membership to Improve Racial Equity

Medical Enrollment by Gender: Employees and Dependents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Plan</th>
<th>CCSF</th>
<th>SFUSD</th>
<th>SFCCD</th>
<th>CRT</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Blue Shield Access+ HMO</td>
<td>&lt;26</td>
<td>212</td>
<td>182</td>
<td>111</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Blue Shield Trio HMO</td>
<td>&lt;26</td>
<td>463</td>
<td>117</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Blue Shield of CA PPO</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>841</td>
<td>61</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health Net CanopyCare HMO</td>
<td>276</td>
<td>290</td>
<td>&lt;26</td>
<td>&lt;26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kaiser Permanente HMO</td>
<td>19,928</td>
<td>19,172</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>531</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Due to small enrollment, data not available for UHC PPO and EPO plans.

Average Age by Medical Plan: Employees and Dependents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Plan</th>
<th>Average Age</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>UHC Doctors EPO</td>
<td>58.13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UHC Select Network EPO</td>
<td>57.86</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UHC PPO</td>
<td>53.80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Blue Shield of CA PPO</td>
<td>39.98</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Blue Shield Trio HMO</td>
<td>37.39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health Net CanopyCare HMO</td>
<td>36.47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Blue Shield Access+ HMO</td>
<td>36.34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kaiser Permanente HMO</td>
<td>35.90</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Average Overall Age: Employees and Dependents: 36.21

An absence of Sexual Orientation and Gender Identity (SOGI) data makes it difficult to quantify the needs and well-being of the LGBTQIA+ population;

SFHSS is working with health plan partners to expand Sexual Orientation and Gender Identity Categories in accordance with the SOGI Data Ordinance passed by the San Francisco Board of Supervisors.
What is an equity practice that your department has implemented in the last year and can share with other departments?

- SFHSS is leading with equity to support our membership in accessing the care they need when they need it, regardless of personal characteristics such as gender, ethnicity, geographic location, and socioeconomic status. As we advance this 2023-2025 Strategic Plan, SFHSS is aligning with leading health authorities to ensure that equity is engrained within the fabric of our mission, vision, values, and strategic goals.

- Delivery system transformation aimed at achieving better health outcomes requires care models that integrate a broad array of services to address physical, behavioral, and social needs. Our department recognizes that Race and the Social Determinants of Health (SDoH) – conditions in which people are born, live, learn, work, play, worship, and age – play a significant role in well-being. The Strategic Plan 2023-2025 process represents a shift from provision of benefit services to a deeper understanding of our population’s needs in connection with principles of health equity.

- Equity/Health Equity are our core sphere of influence in relation to racial equity action planning and SFHSS is mirroring the city-wide framework to tackle internal and external phases of work:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>San Francisco Health Service System Strategy</th>
<th>Crosswalk to REAP Framework Focus Areas</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>INTERNAL Actions to apply equity lens to our SFHSS Workforce and Health Service Board</td>
<td>Diverse and Equitable Leadership and Management</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EXTERNAL Actions to apply health equity lens to our Customer Service Approach through Health Plan Partnerships</td>
<td>Boards and Commissions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Organizational Culture of Inclusion and Belonging</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Leading with equity is critical to all SFHSS Strategic Goals:

- A health system that examines the link between cost, quality, and health equity contributes to greater affordability and sustainability.

- There are concrete practice and policy-level actions that primary care stakeholders can pursue to reduce health inequities.

- Fostering equity is a positive catalyst to organizational culture, accessibility, inclusion, and belonging for our membership.

- Risk factors tied to mental health and well-being are heavily associated with social determinants and inequalities among marginalized groups.

- Optimizing service through member engagement and outreach can be a vehicle for reducing health disparities and advancing health equity.
INTERNAL Actions to Support Future State: applying equity lens to our SFHSS Workforce and Health Service Board

- The SFHSS Racial Equity Climate Survey provided multiple open-ended questions through which staff can provide input to senior leadership. Survey themes included staff familiarity with racial equity, personal culture and sharing preferences, awareness of racial equity statements, experiences with interpersonal and institutional racism, and approaching and ending racial inequities. SFHSS is consulting with the Department of Human Resources on survey development for Q4 2023. Survey results/analysis are incorporated into the ongoing development of SFHSS' Racial Equity Action Plan initiatives.

- SFHSS Leadership provides diverse educational opportunities that support Health Service Board Commissioners in acquiring the knowledge they need to effectively carry out their duties in alignment with the Racial Equity Action Plan. Annual board education training topics leverage relevant social context and foundational concepts from the SF Office of Racial Equity, SF Department of Human Resources, Government Alliance on Race and Equity and other thought leaders in the field.
  - Director's Report on Race, Equity, Diversity, Inclusion Updates (ongoing monthly updates)
  - SF Online Learning Module Transgender 101
  - Mental Health: Creating A Culture of Caring Presentation – Deryk Van Brunt, DrPH, UC Berkeley
  - Aging and Aging Well in the 21st Century Presentation – Joseph Agostini, MD, United Healthcare
  - Well-Being at Work Conversation with diverse city departments

- SFHSS is continually seeking high level of engagement from staff of all levels in activities to normalize conversations about equity and operationalize new behaviors that support inclusivity and belonging.
  - All-Staff Race, Equity, Diversity, Inclusion Updates (ongoing monthly updates)
  - SF Online Learning Module Transgender 101
  - SFHSS Annual All-Staff Retreat: All 50+ staff completed the Workplace DISC assessment tool. SFHSS obtained a group cultural report from the Department of Human Resources to learn about behavioral style(s) at work, better understand their communication preferences, and to learn how to better flex to meet each other’s needs.
  - SFHSS Employee Appreciation Potluck Luncheon - hosted to highlight the importance of managers thanking employees when they do good work. SFHSS staff consistently demonstrate organizational values of Compassion and Accountability despite working with a severe staffing shortage and dealing with the extended absences of some of our key staff.

- Implementation of standardized process and protocol for administering department exit interviews to assess overall experience within the organization and to identify opportunities to improve retention and engagement. The goal of consistency and standardization will help to foster positive relationships with both departing staff and new hires while seeking to better understand the connection between employee feedback, behavior, and organizational trends in discipline and separation.
EXTERNAL Actions to Support Future State: 
Applying equity lens to our customer service approach through Health Plan Partnerships

- Requested health equity statements (declarations) from all health plan partners along with information on internal working groups tasked with addressing disproportionate health outcomes and the significant impact race and ethnicity have had on patient health.
- Requested that health plan partners submit a subset of National Committee for Quality Assurance (NCQA) Healthcare Effectiveness Data and Information Set (HEDIS) measures for the SFHSS membership. Understanding the baseline and strengthening data partnerships through health plan report auditing formalizes processes for identifying and addressing health disparities that disproportionately affect communities of color.
- Audited current measurement practices and capacity to collect and report patient race, ethnicity and language (REAL) data to SFHSS for PY2022. The aim is to collect and use race, ethnicity and language (REAL) data in a meaningful way to understand and address health care disparities among various racial and ethnic groups.
- Requested proposals for how to use BRFSS (Behavioral Risk Factor Surveillance System) data as a proxy until race, ethnicity and language (REAL) data can be collected, where limitations exist.
- Confirmed whether plan partners have applied National Standards for Culturally and Linguistically Appropriate Services (CLAS) in Health and Health Care measurement standards. If not, outlined willingness to pursue the addition of these standards in future provider contracting processes.
- Confirmed health plan partners support of Covered California’s Attachment 1: quality, equity, and delivery system reform requirements.
- Confirmed whether health plan partners have sought or plan to seek NCQA Health Equity Accreditation by 12/31/2023. This distinction is a nationally recognized evaluation of how well health plans and other organizations meet the needs of diverse populations.
- SFHSS joined Blue Shield of California (BSC) and Healthy Engineered at the May 2022 Annual Employee Health Care Conference in San Diego for a panel titled, Accelerating Health Equity in Underserved Communities. This presentation highlighted joint efforts to launch a community health advocates program centered around increasing care coordination, primarily for needs related to the social determinants of health such as housing, transportation, or food assistance.
- SFHSS represented on the Department of Managed Healthcare (DMHC) Health Equity and Quality Committee and Integrated Healthcare Association (IHA) Board of Directors.
- SFHSS was invited by Purchaser Business Group on Health (PBGH) to present at their November 2022 Health Equity Subject Matter Expert Session and December 2022 Improving Health Equity: Strategies to Implement Today Session. At both sessions, San Francisco Health Service System discussed the time and resources committed to reducing health inequities and why employers should consider investing in strategies and solutions that address the core drivers of racism.
- SFHSS also serves as a PBGH Member Advisor in support of the PBGH Purchaser Engagement division. This role includes the evaluation of health equity criteria and standards for employers and other health care purchasers focused on investing in and evaluating health equity solutions. PBGH’s nonprofit coalition represents nearly 40 private employers and public entities across the U.S that are working to provide equitable benefits across populations, plans and geographies.
What is an equity practice that is a priority for your department to learn from other departments this upcoming year?

- SFHSS is receiving requests from departments to provide mental health support in response to Racial Equity Action Plan mandate directive 6.1.5 Support and Provide Spaces for Affinity Group, Prioritizing Historically Marginalized Peoples.
- The Behavioral Health Workforce landscape has national and statewide shortages and even deeper shortages among BIPOC clinicians that represent the diversity of the CCSF employee population.
- Although SFHSS has made significant strides in the arena of Mental Health as demonstrated on the following slides, SFHSS is not a subject matter expert in ERGs and does not have the staffing or budget to full fill these asks.
- We want to make sure that SFHSS’ response to these inquires align with Office of Racial Equity’s guidance as the issuer of the citywide mandate.

**The Nature of the Asks: 7 City Departments**
- Funding, staffing, tools, resources, best practices
- Clinician-led healing/resilience circles, ERGs, affinity groups
- Point in time or ongoing support
- LGBTQIA+, Men’s, Women’s, Black, Latinx, API, Native American, etc.
Equity & Mental Health

Fostering **equity** is a positive catalyst to organizational culture, accessibility, inclusion and belonging for our membership.

Risk factors tied to **mental health and well-being** are heavily associated with social determinants and inequalities among marginalized groups.

**Equitable health care also requires addressing Social Determinants of Health**

- LGBTQ individuals are 2.5 times more likely to experience depression, anxiety and substance misuse compared to heterosexual individuals.
- Depression in Blacks and Hispanics is likely to be more persistent.
- Adults with disabilities report experiencing frequent mental distress nearly 5 times more often.

---

1. American Psychiatric Association — Mental Health Disparities, LGBTQ
2. American Psychiatric Association — Mental Health Disparities, Diverse Populations
3. Centers for Disease Control and Prevention — The Mental Health of People with Disabilities
Timeline of Mental Health Initiatives
SFHSS and Stakeholder Partners

March 2020
SFHSS Remote Workforce and Disaster Service Worker Deployment

May 2020
SFHSS launched Cordico, a customized wellness app for use by all City first responders, current employees and retirees

May 2021
SFHSS launched annual Mental Health Awareness campaign

April 2022
Subject matter expert presented on Population Mental Health at the Health Service Board Strategic Plan Special Meeting

April 2022
Developed Mental Health Personas with demographics that reflect the rich diversity of our membership and employed graphic artist as an inclusive medium

February 2023
SFHSS and Aon present findings and recommendations to the Health Service Board

April 2020
SFHSS executed contract with ComPsych for 24/7 EAP services in response to Mental Health crisis

May 2021
SFHSS Well-Being Manager presented on Mental Health Support resources available to members at the Health Service Board Meeting

March 2022
Mental Health and Well-Being elevated in Strategic Plan Environmental Scan Analysis

November 2022
SFHSS expanded EAP services for City first responders through Managed Health Network

January 2023
SFHSS and Aon present findings and recommendations to collaborative stakeholders and health plan partners

Q4 2023
SFHSS and Aon authoring narrative report of actions to support the Mental Health of our membership
What does SFHSS seek to learn in support of equitable mental health for our membership:

✓ How is the Office of Racial Equity (ORE) cataloging Employee Resource Groups (ERGs) citywide?
✓ Does this city-wide ERG list show departmental vs. interdepartmental groups?
✓ How does the ORE respond to staffing/budgetary support requests for these mandated ERGs as the issuer of the citywide mandate?
✓ How can ORE help to set the precedent that one department cannot fulfill aspects of the REAP mandate on behalf of many others due to city-wide staffing shortages and budget cuts?
✓ What tools, resources, best practices and guidance does ORE circulate to respond to these ERG related requests? E.g. ORE’s Request for Information results for racial equity professional services.
Racial Equity Action Plan

Racial equity is the just and fair inclusion in society so that all people participate, prosper, and reach their full potential, no matter their race, ethnicity or background.

SFHSS Racial Equity Action Plan: https://sfhss.org/reap

See all Departmental Racial Equity Action Plans: https://www.racialequitysf.org/dept-racial-equity-action-plan