



HEALTH SERVICE BOARD CITY & COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO

Mary Hao
Vice President

Jack Cremen
Commissioner

Supervisor Matt Dorsey
District 6
Commissioner

Art Howard
Commissioner

Gregg Sass
Commissioner

Fiona Wilson, MD
Commissioner

Claire Zvanski
Commissioner

Abbie Yant, MA, RN
Executive Director
Health Service System

Holly Lopez
Executive Secretary

TEL (628) 652-4646
FAX (628) 652-4703
<http://www.sfhss.org/>

HEALTH SERVICE BOARD

SPECIAL MEETING MINUTES

Tuesday, June 18, 2024, 9:00 a.m.

City Hall, Room 408

1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place
San Francisco, CA 94102

and

VIRTUAL PRESENTATION BY SFGOV TV and Webex

Remote Meeting Access

The Health Service Board welcomes public participation during public comment periods. There will be an opportunity for the general public to comment at the beginning of the meeting and on each discussion or action item on the agenda. Each comment is limited to 3 minutes, and the Chair may, at their discretion, limit public comment to less than 3 minutes per member of the public. For those attending remotely, the Commission will hear up to 30 minutes of remote public comment total for each agenda item. Remote public comment from people who have received an accommodation due to disability will not count toward the 30-minute limit.

Watch at 9:00 a.m. on June 18, 2024 (via [SFGovTV schedule](#))

Click the link to join the meeting – [June 18, 2024 HSB Special Meeting WebEx link](#)

Public Comment Call-In: 415-655-0001 / Access Code: 2664 006 5425 Webinar Password: 1145

Listening to the meeting via phone

1. Dial into **415-655-0001** and then enter **access code** 2664 006 5425, then #
2. Enter Webinar Password: 1145 then press #
3. Press *3 to enter the Public Comment queue, and you will hear the prompt, “You have raised your hand to ask a question; please wait to speak until the host calls on you.” When the system message says, “Your line has been unmuted,” - **THIS IS YOUR TIME TO SPEAK.**
4. You will be muted when your time to speak has expired.

Watching the meeting on WebEx

1. Join via hyperlink [June 18, 2024 HSB Special Meeting WebEx link](#)
2. **Click on the Raise Hand Icon** to be placed in the queue to speak. A raised hand will appear next to your name. When you are unmuted in the system, a request to unmute will appear on your screen, please select unmute to speak.
3. When you are unmuted in the system, a request to unmute will appear on your screen, please select unmute to speak. Once you hear me say “Welcome Caller,” you can begin speaking.
4. When your time has expired, you will be muted. Please click on the Raise Hand Icon to lower your hand.

Members of the public are encouraged to state their name clearly, although you may remain anonymous. You will hear an audible warning when you have 30 seconds remaining. When your 3 minutes have ended, you will be placed back on mute.

Best Practices when Calling in for Public Comment:

- Call from a quiet location
- Speak slowly and clearly
- Turn down any televisions or radios around you
- Address the Commission as a whole; do not address individual Commissioners

Written Public Comment

Persons unable to attend the meeting may submit written public comments regarding an agenda item. These comments will be made part of the official public record and shall be brought to the attention of the Health Service Board. Written public comments expected to be part of the official record should be submitted to the Board email, health.service.board@sfgov.org, and **received by 5 p.m. on Monday, June 17, 2024**, before the meeting. Members can also call 628-652-4646 with any questions.

All comments received by the deadline will be forwarded to Board members, and the Board Secretary will note on the record during the specific agenda item that the Board received written public comment on that item and will include that note in the meeting minutes. In the body of your email, indicate the meeting date and the particular agenda item number. If you do not specify an agenda item, your emailed public comment will be read under general comment.

The Health Service Board meeting recording is available on the [June 18, 2024, HSB Special Meeting webpage](#). Recorded archives of regular board meetings are available on the [SFGovTV Health Service Board meeting webpage](#).

1. **CALL TO ORDER:**

2. **ROLL CALL:**

Vice President Mary Hao- Present
Commissioner John Cremen- Excused
Supervisor Matt Dorsey- Present
Commissioner Art Howard- Present
Commissioner Gregg Sass- Present
Commissioner Fiona Wilson, MD.- Present
Commissioner Claire Zvanski- Present

Vice President Hao said this special meeting of the Health Service Board is convened because the Board rejected the staff's recommendations for the RFP for Blue Shield of California's new Medicare Advantage PPO plan and also rejected the renewal of UHC's MAPD PPO plan. Both items are reconsidered as the charter mandates the Health Service Board to adopt plans for retirees. She said that agenda item 3 is the staff recommendation for the Blue Shield of California plan. The following UHC item will be rendered null and unheard if the Board approves the staff RFP recommendation. If it doesn't pass, we will proceed to the UHC item.

Vice President Hao said public comments will be limited to one minute to ensure everyone has a chance to speak. Public comment is for expressing opinions and concerns, not for engaging in Q&A with the staff or Board members.

Vice President Hao announced that the newest member of the Health Service Board, Dr. Fiona Wilson, is the Chief Physician for the City and County of San Francisco Employees within the Department of Human Resources. Commissioner Wilson shared her specialty as an internist with approximately 20 years of experience as a practicing physician with UCSF and in a leadership role at Brown and Toland Medical Group. Commissioner Wilson said she was hired by the City as the Chief Physician four years ago, during the onset of the COVID pandemic. Commissioner Wilson said her focus is on serving and listening to the needs of our active employees and retirees.

3. **SFHSS STAFF REQUEST FOR PROPOSAL (RFP) RECOMMENDATION FOR THE MEDICARE PLAN MAPD (MEDICARE ADVANTAGE PRESCRIPTION DRUG) PASSIVE PPO FOR THE 2025 PLAN YEAR: ADD THE BLUE SHIELD OF CALIFORNIA (BSC) MEDICARE ADVANTAGE PRESCRIPTION DRUG (MAPD) PASSIVE PPO PLAN FOR MEDICARE MEMBERS, AND OFFER THE EXISTING BSC HMO (ACCESS+/TRIO) AND PPO PLANS TO NON-MEDICARE "SPLIT FAMILY" COVERED LIVES IN FAMILIES WITH AT LEAST ONE COVERED MAPD PASSIVE PPO PLAN COVERED LIFE-WITH THE 2025 PLAN YEAR RATE CARDS CONTAINED IN THIS MATERIAL; AND DISCONTINUE THE UNITEDHEALTHCARE (UHC) MAPD PASSIVE PPO PLAN, UHC NON-MEDICARE SELECT EPO PLAN, UHC NON-MEDICARE DOCTORS EPO PLAN, AND UHC NON-MEDICARE PPO PLAN: (ACTION)**

[See the pdf of the SFHSS Staff Recommendation for RFP MAPD Passive PPO for the 2025 Plan Year presentation.](#)

Abbie Yant, SFHSS Executive Director, Michael Visconti, SFHSS Contract Administration Manager, and Mike Clarke, Aon, welcomed questions from the Board. Commissioner Zvanski asked how
1145 MARKET STREET 3RD FLOOR, SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94103

many retirees will be impacted if the staff recommendation for the MAPD Passive PPO plan is approved. Mike Clarke, Aon said about 17,000 who are Medicare plus 1,000 non-Medicare covered lives would be transitioned from the United Healthcare to the Blue Shield of California administrator. Executive Director Yant said member details are listed in the February annual demographics report presented to the Board.

Supervisor Dorsey moved to accept the staff recommendation of the Medicare Advantage Prescription Drug Passive PPO for the 2025 plan year. Commissioner Wilson seconded the motion.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

In-person Public Comment

Karen Breslin, Retiree: Quoted the Health Service Board Terms of Reference Policy 201 regarding how the Board can reconsider an action item and objected to the need for a special meeting to reconsider an issue already voted on in a previous meeting.

Adam Wood, Secretary of the Firefighters Union Local 798, Vice President of the Firefighters

Cancer Prevention Foundation: Urged the Board to reject the staff recommendation.

Chat Urtola, Retired Firefighter: Urged the Board to reject the staff recommendation.

Anonymous: Urged the Board to reject the staff recommendation.

Peter Tynan, Retiree SFMTA: Urged the Board to reject the staff recommendation.

Herb Wiener, Protect Our Benefits: Urged the Board to reject the staff recommendation.

John Skytononsky, Retiree: Urged the Board to reject the staff recommendation.

Liana Dewitt, Retired San Francisco Police Sergeant: Objected to the need for a special meeting to reconsider an issue already voted on in a previous meeting.

Phylliss Harding, Retiree, Health Department: Urged the Board to reject the staff recommendation.

Floyd Rollins, President of the Firefighters Local 798: Urged the Board to reject the staff recommendation.

Larry Barsetti, Retiree, Secretary of the San Francisco Veteran Police Officers Association, and Chief Financial Officer of Protect Our: Urged the Board to reject the staff recommendation.

Renior Rapanani, Retired San Francisco Police Sergeant and Police Attorney: Objected to the need for a special meeting to reconsider an issue already voted on in the previous meeting.

Dennis Kruger, Retired and Active Firefighters and Spouses: Urged the Board to reject the staff recommendation.

Annie Haize, Retiree City College of San Francisco, Counselor: Urged the Board to reject the staff recommendation.

Fred Sanchez, President Protect Our Benefits, Member of RECCSF, Member of CARA: Disagreed with the Board's actions.

Pat Martinez, Retiree San Francisco Fire Fighter: Expressed their distrust in the City and County of San Francisco.

Ramelia Scott, Retiree, San Francisco Fire Fighter: Urged the Board to reject the staff recommendation.

Remote Public Comment

Maureen Noonan, Retiree, City College of San Francisco: Urged the Board to reject the staff recommendation.

Lois Scott, Vice President of Protect Our Benefits: Urged the Board to reject the staff recommendation.

Commissioner Cremen: Called to state he was unable to attend the meeting. He said he stands by his vote to reject the staff recommendation.

Anonymous, Retiree: Urged the Board to reject the staff recommendation.

Carol Regly, Retiree, City College of San Francisco: Requested that members be able to vote for the plan.

Rita Farner, Retiree: Urged the Board to reject the staff recommendation.

Cynthia Cervetnik: Urged the Board to reject the staff recommendation.

Written Public Comment

The Board Secretary noted over 400 written public comments received by the deadline, all of which were sent to the Health Service Board Commissioners.

Patrick Monette-Shaw: The action this Health Service System Board took during today's meeting with one Commissioner absent should be declared null and void. One speaker — retired San Francisco Police Sergeant Liana DeWitt — testified prior to your four-to-two vote on today's motion on agenda item 3 to reconsider the Board's June 7 vote rejecting Blue Cross of California to be awarded the HSS Medicare Advantage PPO plan contract was improper. DeWitt asserted today's Agenda Item 3 was essentially performing a "*de facto reconsideration*," which can't be done at a later, subsequent meeting. A vote for reconsideration had to have been taken at the initial original meeting on June 7. So this Board's action today to pursue this vote was a "*de facto rescission*," which is illegal. I believe DeWitt is correct this vote will likely subject all of you open to legal challenge, and probably expensive litigation involving an illegal vote.

Supervisor Dorsey expressed his support for the staff recommendation, emphasizing his belief in the integrity of the thorough and meticulous competitive bidding process. Supervisory Dorsey said it is his fiduciary duty to honor the RFP process and, having reviewed the comprehensive 80-page presentation, found no evidence of harm to the delivery of care. He highlighted the broader context of budget constraints, asserting that this decision will not negatively impact the care provided to people. Supervisor Dorsey pointed out the high inflationary costs in the healthcare system and argued that a competitive bidding process is essential to managing these costs. He stressed that rejecting the best bid after such a thorough process would undermine the purpose of competitive bidding. The speaker reaffirmed his support for the staff recommendation, acknowledging that their decision may not please everyone, and stood by his conscience in supporting the recommendation.

Commissioner Zvanski said she would vote in favor of the members.

Commissioner Sass believed Blue Shield could manage the Medicare Advantage PPO as effectively as United Healthcare. He pointed out that the City Charter outlines retiree medical coverage and emphasized the significant financial savings for the City, as most of the premium costs are covered by the City, not the members. Commissioner Sass highlighted that the RFP process was fair, with all respondents aware of the scoring criteria. United Healthcare did not offer price concessions, projecting future costs to rise at the same rate as in the past. Commissioner Sass said he supported replacing UHC with Blue Shield based on the RFP results.

Commissioner Howard said his biggest fear is for the thousand dependents without Medicare who may struggle to find a Blue Shield or Blue Card provider, especially those living in remote areas, hoping the Health Service System can assist them.

VOTE:

Ayes: Dorsey, Hao, Sass, Wilson

Noes: Howard, Zvanski

ACTION: The Health Service Board approved the Staff Request for Proposal (RFP) Recommendation for the Medicare Plan MAPD Passive PPO for the 2025 Plan Year to add the Blue Shield of California (BSC) Medicare Advantage Prescription Drug (MAPD) Passive PPO Plan for Medicare Members and offer the Existing BSC HMO (Access+/Trio) and PPO Plan to non-Medicare "Split Family" Covered Lived with the 2025 Plan Year Rate Cards presented; and discontinue the UnitedHealthcare (UHC) MAPD Passive PPO Plan, UHC Non-

Medicare Select EPO Plan, UHC Non-Medicare Doctors EPO Plan, and UHC Non-Medicare PPO Plan

4. **REVIEW AND APPROVE UNITEDHEALTHCARE MEDICAL/RX FULLY INSURED MEDICARE ADVANTAGE PRESCRIPTIONS DRUG (MAPD) PASSIVE PPO PLAN 2025 RATES AND CONTRIBUTIONS: (Action)-**

The Chair did not call this item, so there was no discussion or vote.

DOCUMENTS ATTACHED: UHC Medical/Rx Fully Insured MAPD PPO Plan 2025 Rates and Contributions presentation

STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

PUBLIC COMMENT:

5. **ADJOURNMENT:** 9:53 a.m.

Health Service Board and Health Service System Website: <http://www.sfhss.org> Summary of Health Service Board Rules Regarding Public Comment

1. There will be an opportunity for general public comment at the beginning of the meeting, and there will be an opportunity to comment on each discussion or action item on the agenda. A member may comment on any matter within the Board's jurisdiction as designated on the agenda.
2. A member of the public has up to three (3) minutes to make pertinent public comments; the Chair has the discretion to limit public comment to less than 3 minutes per member of the public.
3. Public Comment can be given in-person, remotely, or written.
4. Members may submit their comments by email to health.service.board@sfgov.org by 5 pm the day before the meeting start time. These comments will be made part of the official public record and shall be brought to the attention of the Health Service Board. All comments received by the deadline will be forwarded to Board members and the Board Secretary will note on the record during the specific agenda item that the Board received written public comment on that item, and will include that note in the meeting minutes. In the subject line of your email, indicate the meeting date and the specific agenda item number. If you do not specify an agenda item, your emailed public comment will be read under general comment.
5. For those attending remotely, the Commission will hear up to 30 minutes of remote public comment total for each agenda item. Remote public comment from people who have received an accommodation due to disability will not count toward the 30-minute limit.

Knowing Your Rights Under the Sunshine Ordinance

Government's duty is to serve the public, reaching its decision in full view of the public. Commissions, boards, councils, and other agencies of the City and County of San Francisco exist to conduct the people's business. This ordinance assures that deliberations are conducted before the people and that City operations are open to the people's review. For more information on your rights under the Sunshine Ordinance or to report a violation of the ordinance, visit the Sunshine Ordinance Task Force website at <http://www.sfgov.org/sunshine>.

Summary of Health Service Board Rules Regarding Cell Phones and Pagers

The ringing and use of cell phones, pagers, and similar sound-producing electronic devices are prohibited at Health Service Board and committee meetings. The Chair of the meeting may order the removal of any person(s) in violation of this rule from the meeting room. The Chair of the meeting may allow an expelled person to return to the meeting following an agreement to comply with this rule. The complete rules are outlined in Chapter 67A of the San Francisco Administrative Code.

Disability Access and Accommodation

Regular Health Service Board meetings are held at City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, in Hearing Room 416 at 1:00 PM on the second Thursday of each month. The closest accessible BART station is Civic Center, three blocks from City Hall. Accessible MUNI lines serving this location are #42 Downtown Loop and the #71 Haight/Noriega and the F Line to Market and Van Ness and the Metro stations at Van Ness and Market and Civic Center. For more information about MUNI accessible services, call (415) 923-6142. There is accessible parking in the vicinity of City Hall at Civic Center Plaza adjacent to Davies Hall and the War Memorial Complex. Accessible seating for persons with disabilities (including those using wheelchairs) will be available. To obtain a disability-related modification or accommodation, including auxiliary aids or services, to participate in the meeting, please contact Holly Lopez, at 628-652-4646 at least 48 hours before the meeting, except for Monday meetings, for which the deadline is 4:00 pm the previous Friday.

City Hall Room 416 is wheelchair accessible. This meeting will be broadcast and captioned on SFGovTV. Remote public participation is available upon request for individuals who cannot attend in person due to disability. Making a request to participate remotely no later than one (1) hour prior to the start of the meeting helps ensure the availability of the meeting link. Sign Language Interpretation is also available upon request. If requesting remote Sign Language Interpretation, please submit an accommodation request a minimum of 4 business hours prior to the start of the meeting. Allowing a minimum of 48 business hours for all other accommodation requests (for example, for other auxiliary aids and services) helps ensure availability. To request an accommodation, please contact Holly Lopez, holly.lopez@sfgov.org 628-652-4646.

To access the meeting remotely as an accommodation, please use [June 18, 2024 HSB Special Meeting WebEx link](#) or call 415-655-0001. Please find instructions at the beginning of this agenda for how to use WebEx for the purposes of remote public comment.

Sensitivity to Chemical-based Products

To assist the City's effort to accommodate persons with severe allergies, environmental illnesses, multiple chemical sensitivity, or related disabilities, attendees at public meetings are reminded that other attendees may be sensitive to various chemical-based products. Please help the City accommodate these individuals.

Location of Materials

If any materials related to an item on this agenda have been distributed to the Health Service Board after the distribution of the agenda packet, those materials are available for public inspection at the Health Service System during normal office hours. For more information, please contact Holly Lopez at 628-652-4646 or email holly.lopez@sfgov.org. The following email has been established to contact all members of the Health Service Board: health.service.board@sfgov.org. Health Service Board telephone number: 628-652-4646

Lobbyist Registration and Reporting Requirements

Individuals and entities influencing or attempting to influence local legislative or administrative action may be required by the San Francisco Lobbyist Ordinance [SF Campaign & Governmental Conduct Code § 2.100] to register and report lobbying activity. For more information about the Lobbyist Ordinance, please contact the San Francisco Ethics Commission at 25 Van Ness Avenue, Suite 220, San Francisco, CA 94102; telephone (415) 252-3100; fax (415) 252-3112; web site www.sfgov.org/ethics.

Generative AI was used to summarize and clarify discussion points in the meeting minutes.